A Programme Evaluation of 'Palestinian Adolescents: Agents of Positive Change - Towards an Environment Promoting Peace and Reconciliation'

Phases I and II: November 2004 to December 2007

Richard Curtain

Public policy and evaluation consultant

Date: 31 October 2009

Preamble

In writing this report, I tried to respond to at least four audiences, each with their different requirements and expectations. Responding to the donor has been important, in terms of programme impact, efficiency and in ways it can be improved. UNICEF operational staff have a special interest in the results for their country and in learning about good practices that other countries have developed and applied. UNICEF at senior staff level are a third audience, with a particular interest in how well this programme fits into a broader strategy for adolescent development and participation. And not least, programme implementers and beneficiaries want to see their efforts recorded properly and acknowledged. They also want to see that their issues of concern are raised and suggestions for the future noted.

In responding to these four audiences, it has become obvious to me that the report has become too long. So I have divided it into five parts, each of which can be read independently of the other. Part I is directed at those who want a summary of the evaluation's key findings, learn about the programme's successes and read the recommendations. The latter are presented as four futures scenarios rather than as mere suggestions to improve the achievement of the programme's objectives. Part II is for those interested in the extensive information generated from the participant survey on the impact of the programme on participants, parents, centre and communities. Part III is directed at those involved in implementing the programme with information about the efficiency of the programme's operations, the relevance of its activities and programme sustainability. Part IV provides background information on the evaluation's terms of reference, its objectives, the methodologies deployed and the problems encountered.

Many people contributed to the evaluation's breadth and depth of coverage and worked hard to meet tight deadlines. My thanks to the UNICEF MENA regional office's evaluation unit, especially to Dr Pierre Ngom and Ms Besan AbdelQader, who provided the right amount of support when it was needed. The UNICEF programme officers offered the evaluation their full backing and provided useful programme information. The dedicated efforts of the country researchers were vital to the evaluation's efforts to provide a comprehensive assessment of the programme. Special mention must be made of two researchers in particular who worked under the most difficult conditions. Dr Ahmed Abu Shaban, a resident of Gaza, worked above and beyond the call of duty to produce work of the highest standard. Dr Haleama Al-sabbah, under difficult personal circumstances, and facing major logistical problems of travel throughout the West Bank, also produced high-quality work.

A special thanks to those involved in implementing the programme with meagre resources. The centre managers, programme coordinators, partner agency staff, parents and the community members gave of their time freely and offered open and honest assessments of what was working and what was not. Their hospitality in welcoming the evaluation team into their centres is fondly remembered and much appreciated. The adolescent interviewers for the participant survey, many with their own experience of the programme, brought an eagerness and attention to detail that produced high-quality results. A vote of thanks also should go to the programme participants themselves who gave us their time and assessment of the programme's effects. The assistance of Brent Taylor, of the Values Bank Research Centre, Melbourne, Australia, is acknowledged. He provided the expertise and effort to ensure that the survey data analysis was completed succinctly and expeditiously.

Richard Curtain (Dr)
Public Policy Consultant and Programme Evaluator

Table of Contents

Part I: Key Findings and Recommendations

Executive Summary

Chapter One: Lessons Learned & Good Practices

Chapter Two : Recommendations on Key Issues

Table of Contents of Rest of the Report

Part II: Programme Impact

Chapter Three: Programme Impact on Participants

Chapter Four: Programme Impact on Parents

Chapter Five: Programme Impact on Programme Centres

Chapter Six: Programme Impact on Other Stakeholders

Part III: Programme Operation, Relevance and Future Sustainability

Chapter Seven: Programme Efficiency & Cost Effectiveness

Chapter Eight: Stakeholder Analysis

Chapter Nine: Programme Relevance

Chapter Ten: Programme Sustainability

Part IV: Evaluation's objectives, Context and how it was Conducted

Chapter Eleven: Setting the Scene

Chapter Twelve: How the Evaluation was Conducted

Part V: Country Specific Results from the Participant Survey

Executive summary

Phases I and II of the programme 'Palestinian Adolescents: Agents of Positive Change - Towards an Environment Promoting Peace and Reconciliation' took place between November 2004 to November 2007. The expenditure on the programme for these first two phases was just over US$ 1 million. This evaluation, conducted in June and July 2009, collected data on programme impact, relevance of the activities, assessments of its efficiency and cost-effectiveness, and relations with other stakeholders such as UN agencies, NGOs and governments. The evaluation was also asked to identify the factors that could make the programme sustainable.

Impact

In general, the evaluation results show that programme impact has been large and extensive. The results of the data collection provide evidence of self-reported behavioural change on the part of the programme's adolescent participants, their parents, and of wider beneficial effects on the community and programme partners. Table ES1 offers an assessment of the programme's overall twin objectives.

The evaluation results show that the programme has been successful in not only providing safe safes and recreational opportunities for adolescents. More importantly, the programme has changed how community-based organisations such as women's centres and sports clubs, governments and UN agencies view young people. They are no longer merely 'seen but not heard' or, even in some cases, viewed as a threat. They are now more likely to be seen as agents in their own right who can be engaged with as partners. The main vehicle the programme used to promote this new image is through providing the opportunity and support for a series of adolescent-led actions to improve life among their peers and in their wider communities.

However, the evaluation also has found, in terms of the programme's overall objective of promoting peace and reconciliation, that more needs to be done. Survey results suggest that only half of the programme participants are more focused on the need for peace and reconciliation, and more tellingly, only three-in-ten participants have engaged in peace intiatives in their community. The programme's role in imparting skills in conflict resolution and promoting opportunities to apply these skills varies between countries. In Lebanon, particular emphasis has been given to imparting these skills as part of life skills training.

Table ES1: Summary of main evaluation findings: assessment of achievement programme's overall objectives

Overall objectives	Rating*	Successes	Threats	Scope for improvement
Palestinian Adolescents: Agents of Positive Change	4.5	More holistic approach to the needs of adolescents accepted by key stakeholders	Narrow focus on adolescent vulnerabilities & the need to protect	Need to build on this theme through all activities
Towards an Environment Promoting Peace and Reconciliation	3.5	Up to half of programme participants are more focused on peace & reconciliation	Only three in ten participants have engaged in peace intiatives in their community	Scope to focus on this theme more in life skills training & other activities
* Rating based on 1=performed very poorly, 5=performed very well				

Emergence of new programme focus

The programme itself has changed during the period under evaluation. Its starting point was to help vulnerable adolescents to survive and cope with a system that was clearly responding poorly to their needs. However, as the self-esteem of programme participants increased, with their acquisition of new capacities, tools and opportunities, enabling them to take the lead, the programme itself developed a different locus, process and orientation.

The locus of activities moved from inside the programme centre to outside. Less commonly, it moved from within the camp, village or local area to other locations outside the camp such as visits to centres for the elderly and the disabled. In terms of process, the change in the programme, in the words of a centre manager, was from 'taught activities' into 'initiatives'; from 'work for adolescents' to activities which adolescents themselves initiated. For example, in oPt and Jordan, the programme enabled young people to make films and use them to hold community discussions on topical issues such as showing the effects of vandalism on public goods and presenting the views of three HIV positive young people. In terms of orientation, programme hosts and parents began also to see adolescents less as vulnerable individuals in need of protection. Centres and parents moved to a much more positive view of young people. This view increasingly sees them, both as individuals and as a group, as able to assess their own situation, work out how to respond and to organise themselves to make a significant contribution.

Did the programme meet its objectives?

The evaluation generated a huge amount of data from a variety of sources. Table ES2 summarises these findings in relation to the programme's Phase I and Phase II objectives. For each objective, the assessment provides a reason for the successful element, a threat to achieving the objective and scope for improvement. The evaluator has rated each objective based on a 1 to 5 scale from 1 = performed poorly to 5 = performed very well.

Table ES2: Achievement of the programme's specific objectives

Specific objectives	Rating *	Successes	Threats	Scope for improvement
Provide safe spaces promoting skills development	3.5	Many friendly spaces created free of many of the constraints of home & school	Access to space dependent on continued funding	Need to make arrangements permanent
	4.0	Parental acceptance for daughters of safe spaces outside home & school	Involvement of parents variable between centres and often only partial	Need to engage with parents better, even in Jordan
	2.0	Programme reach up to one in four of eligible population	More vulnerable not included eg school drop-outs	Need to change activities to meet needs of the more vulnerable
	4.0	Role of facilitators key to engaging with adolescents	Facilitator skills neglected	More exchanges between facilitators at country level needed
	4.0	Remedial education in oPt well accepted by participants	Selection of slow learners not systematic	Need to measure outcomes in Phase III to see who benefits & how much

			Lack of systematic follow-up of slow learners in schools	Need to integrate with UNRWA schools
	3.5	Sporting activities are a prominent feature of the programme	Sporting activities valued by participants less than other activities	Scope to add more value to sporting activities & link with campaigns
Provide appropriate life skills training for adolescents	3.5	Most receive life skills training	Effectiveness of peer educators needs more attention	Scope to include other basic life skills eg conflict resolution, financial literacy
	2.0		Focus on reproductive health weak due to parent concerns	Need to engage with parents more to address their concerns
	2.0		Lack of attention to post school options	Scope to include more on employability & available work opportunities
Undertake action research to support adolescent-led initiatives	4.0	Valuable research skills imparted	Need for better integration in some cases between action research & adolescent-led initiatives	Scope to improve research depth to provide social map of adolescents
	3.0	A range of issues identified from important to the trivial	Lack of systematic process for identifying the most suitable issues to focus on	Scope to make good use of simple social marketing tools
	3.5	Use of evidence enhanced status of adolescents as advocates	Research too limited in scope & method to have long-term impact	Scope to develop key indicators to monitor change in situation
Undertake initiatives to improve communities & capacity of adolescents to realise their potential	4.0	Strongest expression of programme theme 'agents of positive change'	Danger that key issues are addressed in a limited way in local setting only	Need for planning, resources & focus on cross-camp or national campaigns
Develop leaders who can mobilise other adolescents for community action	3.0	Committed cadre developed with good skills set	Lack of ongoing support for the cadre	Need to continue to tap skilled cadre beyond adolescence
Enable adolescents to participate in managing the safe spaces	3.5	Where able to participate, many benefits gained for improving the programme	In some centres, participation limited to seeking feedback only	Scope to improve nature & extent of adolescent participation
Support networking among adolescents	2.0	Opportunities to visit other camps, with one inter country visit	Activities too restricted to one location	Repeated requests for trips to escape confines of camp or locality
Coordinate with other organisations working with adolescents	3.0	Good but variable cooperation between UN & govt agencies at ground level	Lack of formal agreements with UNRWA in all countries except Lebanon	Need to make innovations part of mainstream service delivery
	3.5	In oPt, good cooperation with	Limited contact at national level with PA's	Need for inter-agency MoUs for joint actions

		implementing NGOs and PA's Min of Youth & Sport	Min of Education	

*Rating based on 1 = performed very poorly, 5 = performed very well

Addressing priority issues

How far do the programme activities address priority issues? Adolescents and parents in the focus group discussions identified key problems and ranked them in order of their importance. The problems that received first and second priority ranking from each of the groups are listed below in Table ES3. The comparison of the high-priority problems and programme activity shows that the programme, considered as a whole, did respond to many of the issues of concern raised (see Table ES3). However, the programme responses are often limited to one country or are yet to be implemented.

This comparison shows that more needs to be done to transfer the appropriate response from one or two locations to all locations. Giving more attention in the action research and adolescent-led initiatives to peace and reconciliation or the youth-oriented Millennium Development Goals ensures that the big issues addressed. The use of the Millennium Development Goals as a frame of reference is well accepted within the UN system, among major donors and increasingly with national governments. This focus should make it easier to obtain interagency cooperation, if all the stakeholders involved are aware of the 'big picture' and want to show real improvement in the internationally accepted indicators.

Table ES3: Comparison of the top two priority problems of Palestinian adolescents and parents with programme activities, actual and potential, all countries

Priority problem	Actual programme activity	Potential programme response
General living conditions		
High population density of the camps; poverty and low level of the public services.	Participatory action research (PAR) & adolescent-led initiatives in Lebanon in particular	Undertake social mapping of camp households to record access to services and special needs planned for Lebanon 2009
Pollution and lack of hygiene in the camp (waste dumps exist in between the houses)	Participatory action research & adolescent-led initiatives in some camps	Conduct cross camp campaigns with focus on attainable and measurable goals
Difficult financial situation due to poverty and unemployment; No jobs after education.	Issue not addressed as no explicit targeting of early school leavers (drop-outs)	Add new module on employability in Jordan to life skills training in each other location
The negative attitudes people outside the camp have towards the population in the camp.	Connections to the wider society in Syria being fostered. Some trips part of programme activities	Make more and better connections to peers in wider society
Fear and psychological difficulties.	Pyscho-social training in Lebanon	Provide pyscho-social training for adolescents & agency staff in Gaza in particular
Low-quality education		
Educational problems at schools (e.g. large number of students in classrooms, dropouts);	Remedial learning (RL) component in oPt. In Jordan, Lebanon & Syria, RL provided but not funded by programme budget.	Incorporate directly or indirectly into UNRWA education system & PA Ministry of Education schools thru joint actions

Lack of understanding between parents and adolescents		
Lack of understanding/dialogue between parents & adolescents, esp with females; 'Family and in-school violence against young females; Early marriage; Family restrictions on females movement.	Extended workshops for parents in Jordan; intergenerational dialogue in Lebanon; local management committees in oPt include parents, conflict resolution skills in basic life skills training in Lebanon & Syria	Need to: extend workshops for parents to all countries; make special arrangements for fathers, eg, venue & speakers; include adolescents in intergenerational dialogue
Lack of awareness of youth issues	PAR & Adolescent-led initiatives in some camps focus on youth issues	Cross camp campaigns needed with focus on attainable and measurable goals
Need for education and cultural centres for adolescents		
Lack of cultural & educational centres for adolescents for adolescent boys who are marginalised & spend most of their time in streets in addition to smoking problem.	Adolescent friendly spaces address this need for a minority of adolescents only, with a predominant focus on those in school	Expand the programme by extending its reach from existing centres, adding new centres & targeting vulnerable groups more
The problem of Internet and the access to bad websites	Tried to address this in Jordan but website hacked into and stopped	Set up a Facebook site for the programme & invite adolescents to network across the programme

Recommendations need to be set in context

The evaluation is not able to offer a simple set of recommendations for the programme in individual countries, except in relation to programme evaluation. This is for three reasons. First, the evaluation relates only to Phases I & II of the programme. This means that the information and analysis reported here does not take into account the changes made to the programme in its third phase. These changes already underway will affect whether a specific recommendation is needed or how it is framed. Second, the evaluation was not asked to refer to nor was it briefed on UNICEF MENA strategy for adolescent participation and development. This will shape the specific form that the recommendations related to the future direction of the programme will take.

Third, a single list of recommendations would imply that the programme should proceed as it now is and that the only changes needed are small and incremental. This would miss an opportunity to discuss and agree on more fundamental changes if these are deemed desirable. Many of the possible changes that the evaluation could suggest depend on in which future direction the donor, UNICEF and other stakeholders want the programme to proceed. It is not appropriate for this evaluation to propose any one direction, as each depends on an assessment of a range of factors external to this evaluation. These include available future funding, the scope for closer cooperation with other agencies and governments and, not least, UNICEF's own future strategic direction in relation to adolescent development and participation.

So the recommendations from this evaluation are placed within the context of four futures scenarios. These possible future directions for the programme are: to deepen the programme's impact; extend its reach; consolidate an emerging focus; or reorient the programme to make it sustainable in the long-term. However, to make it easier for UNICEF country offices to identify what recommendations might apply to their programme, a matrix is provided in Attachment I at the end of Part I, linking the recommendations within the four scenarios to specific countries and the UNICEF MENA Regional Office.

Future scenario 1: deepening programme impact

The first scenario focuses on recommendations to do with placing more emphasis on promoting peace and reconciliation; getting more out of life skills training; enhancing the skills of programme facilitators; getting out of the closed world of the refugee camps; engaging more with parents; and getting more out of adolescent-led initiatives. Under this direction for the programme, recommendations are also made on how to make remedial learning in oPt more effective. These include measuring outcomes; targeting only slow learners; making use of a contract of remedial learning, and working toward a system-wide response.

Future scenario 2: Widening programme impact

The second possible direction presents recommendations which seek to extend the programme by working out who has missed out; and developing a social marketing plan to include all eligible adolescents. Recommendations also focus on extending the programme reach for parents; and specific ideas for marketing the programme to parents. An important element is an extension of programme reach would be to target out-of-school adolescents and develop activities such as helping them to assess their post-school options. Included also needs to be the provision of information to counter the prevailing pessimism among parents and the community about their future prospects.

Future scenario 3: Consolidating and repositioning

A third possible direction for the programme is to consolidate its theme of 'agents of positive change'. This can be done by strengthening those activities that build-up adolescent capabilities and foster opportunities based on these. It would also involve changing the emphasis on other programme activities such as sports that are less well connected to this theme. This could be done by adding more value to them or moving away from them altogether as a programme-funded activity.

Future scenario 4: Addressing programme sustainability

Finally, the fourth scenario addresses the fundamental issue of programme sustainability. This scenario is based on the assumption that UNICEF may come to see as not a desirable long-term option the oversight of a stand-alone programme based on time-limited external funds. UNICEF may also decide not to continue to support the current form of programme with its predominant focus on school students as its main strategy for meeting the needs of vulnerable Palestinian adolescents. This scenario looks at recommendations for embedding the programme's main innovations in ongoing institutions. In particular, the options for remedial learning are discussed due to its large scale and its importance in terms of raised community expectations. The strengths and weaknesses of two options are discussed: integrating remedial learning into the school system or continuing to run remedial learning from separate centres.

Other recommendations on programme sustainability focus on the need to develop a sustainability strategy for Phase IV of the programme; the need to encourage each centre to charge fees for some activities, the setting up a Palestinian National Youth Fund in each country and the importance of identifying and proposing corporate partnerships.

Need to monitor progress and provide feedback

In terms of programme evaluation, it is recommended that a set proportion of the programme budget, such an 0.5 per cent, should be allocated to cover the cost of putting in place a programme monitoring and evaluation system. These funds should be used to not only support the collection and recording of the data but also in building the capacity of programme coordinators in each centre to analyse the data and produce simple reports for their own benefit.

Measures of progress are essential not merely for accountability purposes. They are also needed to ensure that all stakeholders are motivated to maintain a high standard of performance. This evaluation has demonstrated the value of participant and stakeholder surveys for assessing satisfaction levels. They need, however, to be conducted for each centre to provide much needed feedback to address problems if satisfaction levels decline.

Proposed programme impact indicators

Indicators of programme impact are needed. One set of proposed indicators concern peace and reconciliation. Following practice elsewhere, it is proposed that a 'peace practice effort ' be judged as making a significant contribution to the long-range goals of peace, if it addresses one or more of the following four aspects: it causes participants to take up initiatives for peace work on their own; contributes to the reform or building of institutions that address grievances that underlie the conflict; enables people increasingly to resist violence or manipulation to violence; and increases the security of people and their perception of security.

An important MDG-related impact indicator for the programme is the youth (aged 15 to 24 years) literacy rate. Three programme impact indicators available from existing data sources on Palestinian adolescents are: the primary school completion rate; the transition rate to secondary school and the net secondary school attendance rate. Four other impact indicators are not available from existing data sources but should be are: the middle secondary school completion rate; the senior secondary school completion rate, the post-school jobless rate for 15 to 17 and 18 to 19 year olds, the rate of under age 19 pregnancies, and knowledge of how to prevent HIV/AIDS among young people people aged 15 to 24 years. An indicator of programme reach is also needed. This could take the form of a time-specific programme participation rate based on a definable geographical catchment area such as a refugee camp. Another proposed programme indicator is the male-to-female ratio for specific age subgroups.

Need to publish results and provide a follow-up action plan

It is recommended that the results of this evaluation be published in Arabic in summary form. This report back should also include a coordinated response from UNICEF in the form of an action plan to show how and by when it will respond to the evaluation results. A follow-up process also needs to be set up within UNICEF to report progress on the aspects of the programme that have been improved, changed or added. This follow-up process needs to be accountable to the stakeholders involved in the programme, including the current and former programme participants and transparent in the form of a simple report which can be easily distributed by email and fax.

The purpose of Chapter One is to highlight the achievements of the programme by describing the good practices adopted in particular countries. Starting the report of the evaluation results here also helps to give a much better feel for how the the programme worked on the ground before launching into the detailed statistical presentation of the results in Part II.

Eleven lessons learned or good practices are described, from the inclusion of remedial learning in the programme in oPt and Lebanon; the key role of intermediary NGOs of oPt; a new broader vision for host centres in Jordan and oPt; improving communications with families in Jordan and Lebanon; incorporating conflict resolution skills into basic life skills training in Lebanon; evaluating basic life skills training in Lebanon; addressing employability issues in Jordan; a report on a adolescent-led initiative on 'pollution in the camp'; making good use of systematic research in Lebanon; providing training in pyscho-social skills in Lebanon; and achieving programme cross over in Syria. The evaluator's inability to visit to Syria, made it much more difficult to gather more material on good practices in Syria.

Good Practice 1: Remedial Learning in oPt

The remedial learning component of the programme in UNICEF oPt responds to a major continuing problem the low performance of adolescents in terms of basic literacy and numeracy.[1] UNICEF in 2005 found evidence of the problem of 'masked or hidden illiteracy' among school students. It was estimated that 30 to 40 per cent of adolescents had slipped in reading and writing skills two to three levels below their normal grade.

The remedial learning programme coordinator for Tamar noted a number of reasons the schools provided a poor learning environment: large class sizes (40 to 50 students), a difficult curriculum, teachers following the curriculum in a rigid way, strong exam focus, and little or no focus on the needs of slow learners. A Ministry of Education study in 2006 found that low achievement was among the top reasons students left school before completing their studies. Even when the formal education system introduced remedial classes for low-achievers, it followed the same traditional approach with a large student to teacher ratio in the classrooms.

Also school teachers went on strike in 2006, which led to a recognition that community-based learning opportunities were needed. Since then, according to stakeholder feedback, the Ministry of Education has tried to focus on lifting the quality of schooling but it has had problems with implementing change. These problems relate to teacher inflexibility, the lack of space in the schools, political issues, the overly complex curriculum and other restrictions in how schools function.

The remedial learning component was designed by the Tamar Institute of Community Education, an NGO, established in 1989. Tamer works in the West Bank and Gaza Strip with children and young people to develop alternatives and supplements to formal education. It works within a framework which focuses on the rights to education, identity, freedom of expression, and access to information.

---

[1] The following information on remedial learning in the programme focuses on oPt. The information draws on an interview with the Tamar programme coordinator, extensive background notes provided by Dr Lara Abu-Shilbayeh, the main UNICEF officer overseeing the programme in oPt and information from interviews with facilitators.

Our philosophy is centred on the idea that learning environments for children and young people can only be created among youth who are encouraged to read, write, and participate in dialogue while working in small groups united by a common dream and joint aspirations. In order to increase community learning, youth should also be involved in action at the community level, and come out with a tangible end product.[2]

Discussions with Tamar's programme coordinator, centre coordinators and facilitators suggest that remedial learning has been successful in working from its community base to promote wider change. One way it has done this has been by working through the facilitators who have played a key part in producing that change. Of the 150 facilitators working with Tamar, some 60 per cent are also teachers in the school system. These teachers have benefited from their training in interactive teaching methods and have taken these new approaches back into their classrooms.

The following factors can be identified as key to the success of the remedial learning component:

- guidance from an experienced NGO with a clear vision of what it is seeking to achieve;

- teaching in small groups of 20 students in a non-classroom setting;

- specific focus on the individual needs of students for a specific period (usually two months but could be longer if needed);

- four follow-up meetings with student provided;

- facilitators work as volunteers on a meagre monthly stipend of USD 250;

- facilitators carefully selected for their flexibility, open mindedness, and willingness to encourage participation by students and to use new methods based on 'learning through action';

- their training provided by an experienced innovator in community education in interactive teaching methods such as story telling, word games, creative writing to encourage students' imagination;

- Continuous process for assessing facilitators based on regular meetings between centre coordinators and facilitators each month to discuss and respond to problems;

- Ten area coordinators meet centrally every month for between 4 and 6 hours to discuss problems, share success stories and discuss theoretical approaches; and

- Two-day workshops on key issued to do with improving programme performance for centre and area coordinators

The small class sizes have made it much easier for students to interact with the facilitator. Programme participants have reported that for the first time the teacher listens to us and wants to help us. The training for facilitators has been an important element in the success of the remedial learning. The focus of this training has been on interactive teaching methods including creative writing and expression; and how to communicate with adolescents. Follow up training has included: designing teaching aids; and pre and post evaluation testing to measure improvement in literacy and numeracy skills of low achievers. Facilitators who are also teachers in the school system claim that the training provided by the programme has

---

[2] From the website of the Tamar Institute of Community Education

changed their entire approach to teaching. One facilitator who had been working as a teacher of Arabic for twenty years reported that he had started enjoying teaching again, as he now spent a lot of time preparing teaching aids for low achievers.

Remedial learning is now part of the programme in all 73 adolescent-friendly learning spaces in oPt 2009. Much effort has been exerted in extending the reach of programme's remedial learning component. This initiative has fostered in the community and at higher levels in the Ministry of Education wider recognition of the poor literacy rates of adolescents.

Starting in 2009, the remedial learning classes now operate from 24 schools. However, according to the Tamar programme coordinator using school buildings for the remedial learning classes is less popular among students as they want to have a space over which they have more control. However, in some traditional settings such as Hebron, it is easier for girls to stay in the school grounds than to travel to a centre to take part in the remedial learning sessions.

Good Practice 2: Working through two experienced NGOs in oPt

Delivering the programme through two experienced NGOs has enabled the programme in oPt to operate on such a larger scale with successful outcomes. These NGOs have complementary skills - one focuses on educational innovation through community-based activities and the other has specialist skills in administrative capacity building for community-based organisations. These skills sets have been critical to helping the host centres for the programme broaden their roles and improving their capacity.

The unstable political environment in oPt during 2005-2007, with frequent changes of government, made working with national authorities difficult, especially in relation to the youth sector. The implementation of after-school remedial and recreational activities in youth centres required a concerted effort and a diversity of expertise. UNICEF was only able to achieve this by partnering with both national authorities and civil society organizations. The Ministry of Youth & Sports provided general direction and oversight for the implementation of the programme. Tamer Institute for Community Education and Ma'an Development Centre provided both technical expertise and field capacity to implement the programme.

A working group of all partners chaired by the Ministry met regularly to facilitate overall coordination and provide regular feedback on progress. This forum continues to provide the means for a regular exchange of experiences and information. This UNICEF, government and NGO partnership has improved transparency and accountability of service delivery through continuous monitoring and evaluation. This is done through a periodic (quarterly and annual) peer review of progress and sharing of lessons learnt. This review process has produced a range of suggestions for improvement for successive years.

Two main benefits of the government-civil society partnership can be identified. First, UNICEF has been able through this partnership to address a range of issues facing adolescents, by making good use of the comparative advantage of each partner. For example, in the initial phases of programme implementation, Ma'an Development Centre and Tamer Institute for Community Education agreed to work together closely. This enabled a merging of the former's expertise in capacity building/community empowerment with the latter's expertise in creating and supporting learning environments.

Second, the government-civil society partnership model has also enabled the programme to achieve a wide geographic reach, as each NGO has links with different geographical areas. This geographic spread of the two NGOs made it to expand to 73 adolescent-friendly spaces in 2009. This expansion has allowed the programme to work in every district throughout oPt, and

especially throughout the Gaza Strip.

The Tamar Institute of Community Education been awarded the 2009 Astrid Lindgren Memorial Award, administered by the Swedish Arts Council, with the following citation:

> *With perseverance, audacity and resourcefulness, the Tamer Institute has, for two decades, stimulated Palestinian children's and young adult's love of reading and their creativity. Under difficult circumstances, the Institute carries out reading promotion of an unusual breadth and versatility. In the spirit of Astrid Lindgren, the Tamer Institute acknowledges the power of words and the strength of books, stories and imagination as important keys to self-esteem, tolerance and the courage to face life.*

Ma'an Development Centre was also established in 1989, has offices in Ramallah, Gaza and Jenin and has about 36 staff (2006 Annual Report, p 24). The Centre operates through six units: project development, capacity development and training, community development, agricultural and environmental awareness, accounts administration and admin and logistical support. Ma'an has particular expertise in building up the administrative capacities of NGOs and community-based organisations to lift their effectiveness and sustainability. This is done by increasing their competencies in management, networking and project implementation. Ma'an also has specific programme experience in working with Palestinian youth by enhancing their assets through its youth development and leadership programme. It also works with young people through its entrepreneur development programme.

Sources: Tamar website and Ma'an Development Centre 2006 Annual Report

Good Practice 3: Building Local Community Capacity on oPt and Jordan

Good lessons learned: 1. How to manage with a small amount of money; 2: Proper planning and 3: Time management

Source, Centre manager, Women's Programme Centre, Jordan

A major indirect benefit of the programme has been to build up administrative and planning capacity of the community-based organisations which are hosting the programme. This applies particularly to the training and support provided for women programme centres in Jordan and the youth and sports clubs centres in oPt.

The programme has encouraged the community-based organisations running the host centres to change from their often narrow focus on male sports or women's activities by building up their managerial capacity. Many of the centres have responded well with a broader vision of what they can do on the community and an improved capacity to deliver on this broader vision. For example, one stakeholder in oPt commented that the centre had become 'a real youth and community centre', moving from a focus on football, to now including music, table tennis, small gym machines and aerobics for women.

Initial care had to be exercised in the selection of centres to host the programme to ensure that they had some capacity to manage the programme. It was also necessary to make sure that the centre board and manager understood the programme's objectives and that it was not merely a means for the centre to obtain computers and recreational equipment. The programme has provided a range of different types of training for each centre's board of directors and the programme's local management committees. This training has included how to prepare reports,

child rights, leadership skills, and management skills such as planning and implementation.

In addition to the training, regular meetings with the centres have encouraged them to network with each other and to maintain the momentum of change. UNICEF oPt held six monthly meetings in 2007 with the host centres with a separate topic for each meeting. These included getting local management committees started, enhancing the partnership between Tamer and the management of the centres, use of assessment tools by facilitators and preparation for the summer activities. Recommendations were made and recorded from each meeting for further consideration.

Another important initiative that needs to be adopted elsewhere is to set up a coordinating committee of all the major stakeholders working with adolescents. In Talibiyeh refugee camp in Jordan, they formed such a committee, comprising the head of schools for boys and girls, head of churches' council, head of UNRWA, head of the youth club in the camp, and four adolescents. This committee meets on a monthly basis. The change in the attitudes on one sports club in Gaza is illustrated by the following success story.

Success story from Al Nasser Al Arabi Club

This success story comes from a former centre coordinator and focuses on the administration board as a beneficiary of the programme. This story shows how the programme has helped to change the norms, values and cultural views of adults.
Wafa' AlGhosain used to work as coordinator in the program during its first and second phases. Wafa' explained the difficulties she faced when the program started. The new way of learning was an innovation that no one could understand or even agreed with. The administration board of Al Nasser Club was not convinced that the children could learn anything through entertainment activities and games. They were, however, happy with the activities that motivated and promoted the club. The way they used to treat the adolescents in the beginning reflected the traditional relationship between the teacher and pupil. Sometimes they shouted at the adolescents and criticised them in a very hard way. The materialistic way of their thinking was more administration oriented and they did not care much about the new concept of education presented through the program.

The positive results of the programme have convinced the administration board and many other families from the local community that adolescents can achieve much if we respect them and give them the chance. The significant change in the way they treated the adolescents was amazing. Now they show them great respect and interest in the program activities and the adolescents' achievements. They are now proud of the many success stories produced by the programme. They send the adolescents to represent the club in several events. They are also proud of the music and folklore group which trains in the club. The positive effect of the programme is not only targeting adolescents. It also benefits adults who start to change the way they look at the young people. The programme has started to affect the norms and culture of the society by giving more respect and opportunities to young people. This effect is only a start which is expected to be clearer in future when this young generation grow up and apply the techniques they have learnt. It is a cultural change process where the effect can be seen and sustained for a long time.

Source: Gaza researcher: Dr Ahmed Abu Shaban

Good Practice 4: Improving dialogue within families

> The centre targeted fathers as decision makers. Out of the 110 parents, 44 were fathers. Workshops for fathers were held in 2 youth clubs. The youth club helped in bringing fathers in as fathers participated in sports activities. Fathers would not accept meeting in the women's centre. According to the centre manager, there is no way to measure the influence [of these workshops] on fathers, as they only promised to change verbally.
>
> Source: Interview with Centre manager, Baqa'a Camp Jordan

As already discussed above, improved communications with parents was a major benefit that many participants derived from the programme. The programme in Jordan and Lebanon actively engaged with the parents. Parent workshops in Jordan involved a large number of parents, mostly mothers. Programme participants judged them as effective in improving their parents' understanding of adolescent needs, how to communicate better within families and the importance of supporting adolescent participation in the wider society. However, as noted above, more effort needs to be made to include fathers in this process. Ways need to be found to not only inform fathers about the opportunities available to their children, and overcome their pessimistic views that many have. More active ways need to be explored to engage fathers in how to improve communications within the family, and in how they can support their adolescent children to respond to available opportunities.

Intergenerational workshops in Lebanon

The 'intergenerational' workshops in Lebanon were successful in using interactive methods to enable parents and adolescents experiencing difficulties to resolve their problems in a group setting. The workshops took place under the auspices of the camp popular committee. The committee invited families known to be having difficulties to come together, parents and adolescent children, to discuss the issues with other families in a similar situation and to work out how to resolve them. If the matter was too personal, it was dealt with in private session.

The approach used in Lebanon showed the value of joint sessions where both adolescent children and parents, using a skilled facilitator, have the opportunity to resolve issues within families and, by example, within other families in the community.

Good Practice 5: Life skills training in Lebanon

A number of innovative features of the life skills training in Lebanon are worth noting. The training focused on 72 peer educators who them reached over 700 young people in October and November 2007. The peer educator training was 12 days in duration. The training consisted of three elements: technical knowledge, communication and teaching skills, and teamwork skills. Technical knowledge covered information about basic sexual and reproductive health concepts including HIV/AIDS. Importantly, the second key element of the training was a focus on the causes of conflict, its consequences and ways to resolve conflict peacefully.[3]

The first innovative feature was the use of explicit criteria to select the peer educators. The use of these criteria resulted in the selection of peer educators who were older in general, with over half aged 19 to 25 years, than the peers they were contacting. The life skills training focused not merely on knowledge about HIV/AIDS but also on how to resolve conflict. Lastly, the peer education project was evaluated to see to what extent those contacted retained the knowledge they were given. The evaluation also provided valuable information about the number of peers each peer educator contacted, the sex, age and education level of the peer educators and the

---

[3] UNICEF, 2008, 'Assessment of "Peer Education' Programme, 2008', Evaluation for the Palestinian Area Programme, Lebanon.

same information on those contacted and views on the effectiveness of the training.

Selection criteria for peer educators

The 72 peer educators were selected on the basis of the following criteria: age range from 15 to 25 years, commitment to the goals and objectives of the project, ability and willingness to make the necessary time commitment, interest in working with peers in the Palestinian community, tolerant and respectful of others' ideas and behaviours, and dynamic, motivated, energetic, trustworthy and discreet.

Method of working

The peer educators were asked to work in pairs in order to make their work easier by supporting each other. Male peer educators worked with male counterparts and female educators with their female counterparts. The same sex pairings of peer educators addressed parental concerns and also ensured that the target group members felt comfortable and would participate effectively during the educational sessions.

The communication and teaching skills placed special emphasis on the use of appropriate techniques. Peer educators were taught how to conduct group debates, how to guide the debates as well as how to give clear directions when dealing with a difficult group. Included in the peer educator training was a focus on developing appropriate psychosocial skills to instill in the trainees self-confidence and an understanding of their self worth. Teamwork skills focused on how to work together in conducting 'peer to peer' activities in pairs.

Conflict resolution training

Negative and positive aspects of conflict were discussed fully. The three different schools for resolving conflicts were presented and discussed: violence is used as a last resort (winner-loser); conflict resolution using violence (loser-loser); and conflict resolution using peaceful means (winner-winner). The three stages of conflict were identified: accepting the conflict; analysing the conflict (defining the parties, causes of conflict and types of power: financial means, physical power, mental power, education and experience, and relationships) and transforming the conflict through use of the techniques: dialogue and negotiation, mediation, arbitration and adjudication; conciliation. Issues addressed in conflict management were: separating affection from logic, separating the person from the problem and separating the position from the needs.

The training was assessed to determine whether the peer educators had acquired the knowledge and skills they need to work effectively. A pre-test of the peer educators' knowledge on both conflict resolution and HIV/AIDS was conducted. This helped the trainer and program coordinator to identify strong and weak points in the training, as well as possible topics for follow-up sessions. Assessment focused on the results of the peer education project trying to measure whether the objectives have been achieved and the impact of the project on the population at large.

The problems associated with 'peer to peer outreach' as a method of relaying information on conflict resolution and HIV/AIDS were addressed by strengthening supervision and monitoring. The monitoring system was based on forms on which peer educators recorded the names of the peers reached. At the end of the project, an assessment was made of the feasibility and acceptability of the peer education approach in the Palestinian camps in Lebanon. This assessment noted that the process generated a strong interest and commitment of both the peer educators and the young people who were reached through the project.

Good Practice 6: Evaluating life skills training in Lebanon

UNICEF commissioned an evaluation of the peer education project in Lebanon. The assessment was conducted through interviewing each of the 72 peer educators, and through them information was collected about each of the young people they contacted. The interviews with the peer educators focused on the age, gender, educational background, experience in the social field, his/her membership in the camp youth club, marital status, number of members in his/her family, and information on the newly acquired skills resulting from the peer educators training. Each peer educator was asked to state the number of young people they was able to reach and the home addresses of each peer reached. A response rate of 88 per cent was achieved in the follow-up interviews.

Pre-test constituted the baseline data which was collected before the peer educators began their activities with their peers. Participants were asked to complete, anonymously, a short survey before and after the activity. The follow-up post activity survey included the same questions posed in the pre-test format thus enabling the evaluators to compare results and measure the level of change.

Impact on knowledge, attitudes and practices

Half the peers (52 per cent) gave the training they received a rating of excellent and two in five (42 per cent) gave it a rating of good. Nearly every peer (96 per cent) said the training was useful for their daily life. Tables 26 & 27 below show the proportions of peers had acquired new knowledge and changed their behaviour. Most peers had acquired new knowledge about HIV/AIDS. However, very few appear to have changed their behaviour (avoid vice). However, it is not clear whether the respondents understood what this item was referring to. In terms of changed behaviour in relation conflict resolution, the training seems to have been more effective, as seven out of ten peers said they now resorted to more peaceful means of conflict resolution. However, the responses on the other items are low. This may indicate that the training had little effect on changing behaviour or, more likely, it may reflect a poor understanding of what was being asked of them. It is important that projects doing their own evaluation get expertise advice on how to questions and to refine the questionnaire through pilot testing.

The training in learning how to resolve conflict also has had a variable impact. Table 27 below reports major differences in not only between peers in terms of their acquired knowledge of different aspects of how to resolve conflicts. There are also major differences between males and females in how much they have learned about the difference aspects of resolving conflict. These differences in responses, again, may reflect a lack of understanding of what was being asked. Or they may reflect actual weaknesses in the content provided or the method of training. These results may indicate that imparting knowledge on conflict resolution is a complex matter that needs regular feedback as to what works and what does not. The results also suggest that changing behaviour in how people manage conflict is difficult and requires careful design of the training and follow-up activities to ensure that the lessons are learned by most of those participating in the training.

Table 1.1: Life skills acquired by peers contacted by peer educators, male, female and total, per cent of total peers contacted

Life skills	Male	Female	Total
Acquired new knowledge on HIV/AIDS	76	85	82
Acquired knowledge of misconceptions about HIV/AIDS	6	13	11
Avoid vice (unacceptable behaviour)	5	4	4
Resort to more peaceful methods for conflict resolution	69	70	70
Participation, cooperation & communication	16	12	14
Increase self-confidence	17	21	19
Dealing properly with society	3	11	7
Understanding others	-	8	4
Planning	20	8	13
N	191	434	625

Table 1.2: Knowledge of conflict resolution skills acquired by peers contacted by peer educators, male, female and total, per cent of total peers contacted

Knowledge of conflict resolution skills	Male	Female	Total
How to avoid violence in conflict resolutions	28	41	35
How to dialogue & negotiate	70	35	51
How to keep serene during conflict	12	8	9
How to resolve conflict	28	28	28
How to use adjudication	38	31	34
How to use reconciliation	20	46	33
How to respect others' opinions	4	5	4
N	191	434	625

Good Practice 7: Addressing employability

As noted above, UNICEF Jordan is now working with Save the Children to pilot test in three camps of a new employability component in the life skills training which will address financial competency as well as employment-related issues.

The pilot testing of an employability component for life skills training in three camps in Phrase III will address a major gap in the programme. Youth volunteers from the three camps, selected carefully based on clear criteria, are to be trained in employability skills. These youth trainers will conduct workshops over four weeks to help young people explore their own aptitudes and potential, how to identify sources of background information and discuss education and career options with their parents. Training will also be provided in financial literacy covering how to set personal goals, make informed decisions, how to budget, how to

save and how to use credit. Basic skills in how to manage money as a self employed service provider will also be provided. In an exercise called youth livelihood mapping, young people will be helped to gather, organise, and analyse career opportunities by actively seeking out information on labour market and livelihood opportunities. It is also planned to arrange internships during summer to prove on-the-job work experience and learning opportunity in a private sector enterprise.[4]

Good Practice 8: Adolescent-led initiative in pollution

Adolescents in the largest refugee camp in Jordan identified 'Pollution in the camp" as their initiative. The municipality does not serve the camp and UNRWA provides 60 workers for the whole camp; which gives 10 minutes per street to be cleaned. The camp is very polluted, as sheep and chicken are allowed to be raised in the small aisles of the camp between houses. As a result of the initiative, recycling of waste products by through separating paper, glass, and rubbish in the camp was started and is still going.

Eight adolescents were trained in research skills, then, four focus groups were held, with 15 participants in each. The participants were asked about the major problems in the camp. Hygiene was the first problem identified. The conclusion was that there is not enough budget to collect the garbage of the camp. Throughout the research, adolescents visited the libraries to collect information on pollution, and what measures were being taken in Jordan compared to the camp itself. They prepared and submitted the final report.

Action research activity, Baqa'a camp: 'Pollution in the Camp' Initiative

Given the importance of preserving the environment from pollution and its negative impacts on human health and the society, and because pollution is the major problem identified in the Baqa'a camp, the topic of the research was the eradication of environmental pollution inside the camp, with the participation of camp residents and institutions operating inside the camp.

The research team and methodology

The research team consisted of eight adolescents, 4 boys and 4 girls, that were trained to conduct the research. The research adopted the participatory approach when interviewing individuals and the organisations working with the adolescents, as well as the focus groups held. Four focus group sessions were held, two for 30 adolescents (13-17) years old, and two for the parents and the organisations working with the youth. The following questions were asked to the adolescents: What are the problems that confront you in your daily life (family, community, school)? What are the appropriate solutions to these problems? And What are the recommendations proposed to address the problems?

Most of the interviewed adolescents identified pollution in the camp as the major problem facing them. The problem of pollution was discussed with the two other focus groups, the parents and the organisations working with the adolescents, to identify solutions and recommendations to this problem. Thirty parents and organisation workers attended the two other focus groups, and they were addressed the following questions: In your opinion, the problem of environmental pollution in the camp is a phenomenon to be resolved? What are the causes of this problem? To which extent does environmental pollution negatively affect the populations of the camp? What are the recommendations regarding this problem?

---

[4] Save the Children, 2009, 'Mostaqbaly II programme For Palestinian Refugee Adolescents & Youth Career Preparedness'. Proposal submitted to UNICEF/Jordan Office, May, pp 9-10.

> **Obstacles faced during the research and interviews conducted**
>
> Lack of cooperation from some government departments and civil action teams; implementing the research during school hours; and the absence of some invitees to the focus group held for parents and employers in organisations working with youth. Fifteen interviews were conducted with stakeholders from inside and outside the camp, as they explained how they suffered from the waste accumulated next to their houses that result in the presence of animals, rats, and insects, which explain that bad smell and toxic substances. The interviewees also stated that they had been subjected to some diseases and epidemics, such as: skin and respiratory diseases (asthma, itching, and shortness of breath), respiratory diseases and cancers. Five cleaning workers from within the camp stated that the number of workers ranges between 25-40 workers, a small number compared to the population within the camp.
>
> **Recommendations**
>
> - The transfer the landfill outside the boundaries of the camp.
>
> - Provide non-exposed containers to save the trash
>
> - Transfer chemical plants from inside the camp to outside.
>
> - Provide playing zones for children away from landfills.
>
> - Promote environmental awareness among the population.
>
> - Spread awareness to camp residents on the importance of maintaining hygiene through simple brochures that explain how to get rid of waste.
>
> - Implement cultural events on the phenomenon, to encourage them to find creative ideas to overcome the problem.
>
> - Recycle waste and produce certain materials that can be consumed again.
>
> Source: Consultant's report, translated by Dina Halasa, Excel Consulting.

Good Practice 9: Good use of systematic research

The participatory action research and the adolescent-led initiatives are a common feature of the programme across all locations. They have considerable potential to improve some aspects of the living conditions in the camps and elsewhere. The topics identified and campaigns mounted on included: environmental improvement (cleaning up rubbish in the camp, raising community awareness about hygiene), issues related to adolescents' personal life (family abuse, early marriage, safety on the road, smoking and drug abuse) and education (causes of and responses to school drop outs, violence in schools). However, as the section presenting information on the adolescent-led initiatives makes clear, much more can be done to make these campaigns more effective.

However, only in Lebanon was the commissioned research systematic enough to provide a good basis for mapping a camp's household special needs and access to services. The survey was undertaken against the background of the destruction of Al Bared Camp in mid 2007 which caused a large influx of refugees into Al Beddawi Camp, creating major uncertainty about how many additional people were living in the camp and what their living conditions were like. The survey made it possible to identify the future need for additional school places to cater for the children of the displaced refugees. A social mapping exercise to collect information about the special needs of households and their access to health and other services

will be undertaken in 2009-2010, under the auspices of the Camp's Popular Committee.

Good Practice 10: Addressing fear and psychological difficulties

Again, in the context of recent major conflict, the programme in Lebanon also funded two-day training workshops for service providers in how to provide better psycho-social support to children. The service providers included community workers from NGOs such as the General Union of Palestinian Women, social workers and school counsellors from UNRWA's Social and Education Division and health workers from UNRWA's Health Division. The topics covered: 'helping distressed children cope'; 'managing difficult behaviour'; 'enhancing self esteem'; and 'stress, coping and trauma'. The training provided to school counsellors was judged to be of particular value for adolescents and schools, especially if they could transfer these skills to classroom teachers. Similarly, the consultant trainer found that both social workers and school counsellors would have a much greater impact if they worked with groups rather than with individuals. Considerable scope also exists to impart these skills to parents and to young people themselves.

Good Practice 11: Achieving programme cross-over in Syria

Palestinian girl students in Yarmouk Refugee Camp in Syria took an important initiative in 2007 when they explained the life skills programme to the school principal who supported the concept. The school is a secondary school affiliated to the Ministry of Education. The school management agreed to dedicate one session per week for the girls to conduct life skills sessions. The Syrian girl students in the school welcomed the initiative and sought to extend the initiative to Syrian students as well. This specific example illustrates the changes taking place at an institutional level between UNICEF, UNRWA, and relevant Syrian government agencies.

The programme in Syria has been able to influence other agencies such as UNRWA to undertake similar activities for adolescents. The programme identified a gap in local expertise on adolescent policy and support, and helped to develop this expertise through research and training. As part of UNICEF efforts to build the capacity of policy makers, 67 staff from GAPAR and UNRWA were trained on adolescent development and participation.

Through a joint initiative with the Ministry of Health, another 130 UNRWA health clinic staff from 23 clinics were given training in how to improve both access to the clinics for adolescents and the quality of health care they receive. One good indicator of the recognition by a key agency of the special needs of adolescents was UNRWA's decision in 2008 to create a new youth section within its Social Services Section. The focus of this youth section is on the needs of young people in vocational training centres, schools and health clinics.

In November 2007, a six-day workshop about child participation concepts was organised for policy makers from UNRWA and the GAPAR Social Department. In addition to the 15 senior decision makers from GAPAR and UNRWA, six young trainers from four camps, aged from 18 to 22, were also invited to participate in the workshop. The workshop was presented with evidence of the success of the Adolescent Friendly Spaces and related activities. As a result of the workshop, UNRWA and GAPAR both gave more attention and support to Palestinian adolescent issues.

Another indication of the programme's influence in generating greater attention to adolescent needs at senior policy levels was the inclusion of adolescents in the consultation process for 2007 Situation Analysis of Palestinian Refugees in Syria. UNICEF undertook this analysis in cooperation with the Syrian Commission for Family Affairs. UNICEF Syria has also been working with government ministries, such as the Ministry of Health, to foster a greater

emphasis on adolescent health issues. In 2008, UNICEF, in its dialogue with its Syrian partners, such as the Youth Union and the Red Crescent Society, successfully proposed the programme as a model for addressing the needs of vulnerable adolescents among the Iraqi refugees, newly arrived in the country.

The programme has also fostered within the UNICEF country programme in Syria a greater recognition of the needs of Syrian adolescents. UNICEF has, since 2007, invited adolescents to take part each year in its annual review of operations and its interactions with government partners. An important result of their participation has been a decision by UNICEF Syria to develop its own country programme for youth, modelled on the Palestinian programme. In terms of the office structure, UNICEF has also decided to integrate a focus on adolescents into their three mainstream programme areas. For example, in child protection, the community-based psychosocial support to children and families now has changed to become a more comprehensive system, offering support to adolescents as well.

Chapter Two: Recommendations

What the Programme has achieved

Based on the evidence produced by the evaluation, the programme has been largely successful in meeting its objectives in Phases I & II. The programme started with a focus on carving out 'safe spaces' from within existing facilities to provide opportunities for recreational and learning activities. This required not just creating physical space in the cramped living conditions of the refugee camps. It was also necessary to create the conditions that opened up mental spaces in parents' minds by changing their attitudes to allowing their daughters to participate. This has been a major successful unintended outcome of the programme.

Major lessons from Phase II

The programme in Phase II introduced two elements that gave expression to the programme's underlying theme - Palestinian adolescent as agents of positive change. Participatory action research and adolescent-led initiatives, led by a smaller group within the programme, had a major impact, not only on themselves and other programme participants directly involved. It also changed the perceptions about adolescents held by the stakeholders involved with programme implementation. Their views changed to seeing them more as active partners rather than as passive recipients of services. Their image of adolescents as largely vulnerable and in need of protection changed. They supported activities which aimed at building adolescent capacity through skills enhancement and to opening up opportunities for them to contribute to their communities through participatory action research and adolescent-led initiatives.

With this change in the views of programme operators, parents and the adolescents themselves, other changes also took place in how the programme functioned. The locus of programme activities moved from inside the centre to outside, and, less commonly, from within the camp, village or local area to other locations outside the camp. In terms of process, the change in the programme was, in the words of a centre manager, from 'taught activities' into 'initiatives'; from 'work for adolescents' to activities which adolescents themselves initiated. In terms of orientation, programme operators and parents also saw adolescents less as vulnerable individuals in need of protection and began to view them more as able, as individuals and as a group, to assess their own situation, work out how to respond and to organise themselves to make a significant contribution.

Setting the recommendations in context

The evaluation is not able to offer a simple set of recommendations for the programme in individual countries, except in relation to programme evaluation. First, the evaluation relates only to Phases I & II of the programme. This means that the information and analysis reported here does not take into account the changes made to the programme in its third phase. These changes already underway will affect whether a specific recommendation is needed or how it is framed. Second, the evaluation was not asked to refer to nor was it briefed on UNICEF MENA strategy for adolescent participation and development. This will shape the specific form that the recommendations related to the future direction of the programme will take.

Third, a single list of recommendations would imply that the programme should proceed as it now is and that the only changes needed are small and incremental. This would miss an opportunity to discuss and agree on more fundamental changes if these are deemed desirable. Many of the possible changes that the evaluation could suggest depend on in which future direction the donor, UNICEF and other stakeholders want the programme to proceed. Possible future directions are: to deepen the programme's impact, extend its reach, consolidate an

emerging focus or reorient the programme to make it sustainable in the long-term.

In place of a specific set of recommendations, four future scenarios are offered, each with a discussion of the options that a particular scenario might suggest. The recommendations have been numbered according to the future scenario they are relevant to. As requested, a matrix of numbered recommendations relevant to and to each country and the UNICEF MENA regional office is provided in Attachment V to this report.

1. Programme monitoring & evaluation

> Evaluation is lacking. Evaluation is very slow. We need to measure the impact of the programme. ... It is difficult to measure the social impact, but we should improve it because it has important effect on work.
>
> Source: Assistant Director for the Adolescent programme, UNICEF Syria

However, before discussing possible future scenarios, there is one programme area in which the evaluation can make specific recommendations to improve the programme's systems for monitoring and evaluation. The ToR for the evaluation also asked for recommendations in relation to 'the evaluation of programme activities'.

Recommendation 1.1: Set up a simple monitoring system

The evaluation found the absence of a standardised but simple monitoring data a major limitation on its capacity to answer key questions in relation to cost efficiency and cost effectiveness. This information for each centre on costs, both direct and indirect (eg overheads costs to do with providing the facilities), is essential for centre managers, local management committee and centre boards to work out sustainability options.

A monitoring system should cover the scale of the programme's through-puts (how many participants are involved for how long), scope of activities taking place and cost (what type of activities, when, for how long and at how much cost, direct and indirect) and progress in achieving outcomes. A simple, spreadsheet-based template could be developed centrally and distributed to all centres with computers or as a form for those that do not. The emphasis in developing the template should be on providing information that the centres can use first and foremost for their own internal assessments of progress and cost structures.

Recommendation 1.2: Introduce simple progress measures

Both direct and indirect measures of progress are needed. The direct method of measuring progress is to use the 'before and after' ratings of students in remedial learning which is now a feature of Phase III. Indirect progress measures are available through participant and stakeholder satisfaction surveys, as this evaluation has demonstrated. However, it is important for feedback purposes that these surveys be conducted for each centre for specific activities so that this information can be used by the centre itself to address problems if satisfaction levels decline. The data from this evaluation's participant survey results for each country/region can be used as a benchmark to assess progress. A list of all programme participants with contact details also needs to be kept by each centre.

A proportion of the programme budget, such an 0.5 per cent, should be allocated to cover the cost of putting in place a monitoring and evaluation system. These funds should be used to not only support the collection and recording of the data but also in building the capacity of programme coordinators in each centre to analyse the data and produce simple reports.

Recommendation 1.3: Use widely accepted indicators to show programme impact

Widely accepted but compact set of programme indicators are also needed. As already discussed in Chapter Four, the following programme impact indicators in relation to peace and reconciliation have been proposed by a report for the Berghof Research Centre for Constructive Conflict Management, in Germany. According to this report, a 'peace practice effort' is effective by making a significant contribution to the long-range goals of peace, if it:

- causes participants to take up initiatives for peace work on their own;

- contributes to the reform or building of institutions that address grievances that underlie the conflict;

- enables people increasingly to resist violence or manipulation to violence;

- increases the security of people and their perception of security.

An important MDG-related programme impact indicator is the youth (aged 15 to 24 years) literacy rate. This is usually collected as part of the UNICEF's Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) of Palestinian Refugee Camps and Gatherings in each country. Three other relevant impact indicators available from this survey are:

- the primary school completion rate,

- the transition rate to secondary school and

- the net secondary school attendance rate.

Five other impact indicators concerning Palestinian adolescents which are not available from MICS but should be are:

- the middle secondary school completion rate;

- the senior secondary school completion rate,

- the post-school jobless rates for 15 to 17 and 18 to 19 year olds

- the rate of under age 19 pregnancies, and

- knowledge of how to prevent HIV/AIDS among young people people aged 15 to 24 years.

Another recommended indicator is the programme participation rate. This is a programme-specific indicator which would apply to a definable geographical programme catchment area such as a refugee camp. The programme participation rate should be expressed as: the total number of programme participants for a specific time period as a proportion of their relevant age cohort in the refugee camp or other catchment area. It is also recommended that the male-to-female ratio for specific age subgroups also be a programme indicator.

Recommendation 1.4: Publish the results of the evaluation & provide a follow-up action plan

It is also recommended that UNICEF publish the results of this evaluation in Arabic in summary form. This report back should also include a coordinated response from UNICEF in the form of an action plan to show how and by when it will respond to the evaluation results. A follow-up process also needs to be set up within UNICEF to show what aspects of the

programme have been improved, changed or added. This follow-up process needs to be accountable to the stakeholders involved in the programme, including the current and former programme participants and transparent in the form of a simple report which can be easily distributed by email and fax.

Four Possible Future Directions

Given that the programme has been successful in meeting its objectives, four future directions for the programme can be suggested. One is to deepen the impact the programme - more of the same but better. Another direction is to broaden the reach of the programme so more adolescents and parents can benefit. A third direction is to refocus the programme by taking resources away from some activities and directing them to activities seen to be more consistent with some objectives rather than others. For example, more emphasis in the future could be placed on building on the theme of 'agents of positive change'. This could be done by strengthening those activities that build up adolescent capabilities and open up new opportunities. This would also involve or moving away from other activities that are less connected to this theme or adding more value to them to connect them better to the new direction.

A fourth direction for the programme could be dictated by a sustainability strategy. This may require that some successful elements of the programme be transferred to mainstream institutions to ensure ongoing funding. The strategy may also dictate other changes necessary to attract external funding support from new sources such as corporate sponsors.

This chapter uses these four possible future directions to propose a series of recommendations on possible ways the programme could evolve and change.

2. Deepening Programme Impact

Recommendation 2.1: Do more to promote peace and reconciliation

The evaluation results indicate that more can be done to deepen the programme's impact. An important way to do this is to place more emphasis in programme activities on the objective of promoting an environment promoting peace and reconciliation. This refers not only to adolescents learning how to manage conflict better within their community. Also important areas of potential conflict that need attention are within the adolescent's home and in relations between Palestinian communities and the wider societies that host/control their camps/localities.

As noted above in Chapter Four on programme impact, half of the programme participants had been able to resist calls to violence after involvement in the programme and two in five respondents have helped do something about the issues that cause conflict in my community. Three in ten programme participants have undertaken other initiatives for peace in their community; and only just over one in four have been able to help improve security within their community. These survey results suggest that there is much more scope for the programme to have a deeper impact on changing adolescent attitudes to peace and reconciliation

Also noted above, the programme in Lebanon included within its basic life skills training a focus on skills in conflict resolution. The training covered the topics of how to analyse the role of violence in conflict resolution; the role of dialogue & negotiations, mediation, reconciliation; conflict resolution skills, including how to maintain serenity during conflict.[5]

Was this training effective? The survey results from programme participants in Lebanon in

---

[5] More details of the training provided by the Lebanon-based NGO are provided in Chapter Nine.

relation to the above peace and reconciliation indicators show similar to or better outcomes than the result programme participants from other countries. As noted in Chapter Four, after involvement in the programme, half the participants surveyed in Lebanon have been able to resist calls to violence and have helped to do something about the issues that cause community conflict. Two-in-five programme participants in Lebanon have undertaken other initiatives for peace. After taking into account the more volatile situation in Lebanon, these results suggest that including conflict resolution in basic life skills training has been effective in promoting an environment of peace and reconciliation

Participatory action research and adolescent-led initiatives also provide other opportunities to find effective ways of promoting peace and reconciliation at level of families, communities and within societies. A methodology for doing this is discussed Recommendation 2.7 below.

Recommendation 2.2: Get more out of life skills training

The most widespread programme activity that participants experienced was basic life skills training. The response was a good one, with many seeing it as an important innovation, responding to their needs and offering new skills. However, its delivery mode, format and content varied considerably from country to country and, in some cases, from centre to centre. Volunteer peer educators, with elementary training themselves, delivered life skills training in Jordan, and Syria. In Lebanon, an NGO specialising in peace and conflict resolution, trained an older (over half were aged 19 years and above), more experienced group of peer educators. This included a work-plan for the individual and the project of required activities, responsibilities and goals. These work-plans were used for supervision, monitoring and evaluation.[6] A particular feature of this training has been a focus on peer-to-peer conflict resolution.

In the West Bank and Gaza, programme facilitators delivered the basic life skills training. Where the peer educators did so, the workshops were usually one-off and of short duration. Some complained about the short training: 'the workshops were very short and there is a need [to have] longer ones'. Some workshops included a large number of participants and lacked effectiveness because of this. One female adolescent in a focus group discussion in Lebanon noted:

> *The large number of participants [were] in the life skills workshops. This could be considered a point of strength; however, when having more than 50 participants it [was] so difficult for the facilitators and activists to handle the situation.*

Other focus group discussants asked that life skills activities be expanded to add more, new skills such as emotions management, problem solving, and crisis management. These differences in delivery mode, format and content between countries and within countries should be monitored to work out ways to improve the effectiveness of such a core element of the programme.

Recommendation 2.3: Enhance the skills of programme facilitators

A large part of the reason the programme has achieved a major impact with little resources and in a short time is due to the facilitators who run the activities. They have, for the most part, been highly successful in engaging adolescents. A considerable facilitator skills pool now exists that needs to be further fostered and utilised. Resources need to be provided in the next phase of the programme to bring facilitators together for joint training workshops to identify

---

[6] Partners for Peace, 2008, Assessment of the 'Peer Education' project, 2008, UNICEF Palestinian Programme, Beirut.

lessons learned, and enhance their skill base by learning new training methods. These training workshops for facilitators should also be used as opportunities to discuss and debate the issues related to the sustainability of the programme and develop ideas for new activities that can attract different funding sources.

Recommendation 2.4: Do more outside the closed world of the refugee camps

Another way to deepen programme impact on the existing target group is to help them adolescent more to escape the limitations of the closed world of the refugee camps or the occupied territories. The initial emphasis has been on helping young people to cope better with their situation. It has sought to involve parents, especially mothers, to help improve communications at home. However, relatively little emphasis has been placed on widening adolescents' relations with the external world. In Jordan, the website, 'my identity', was one attempt to give young people the chance to extend their networks to other young people, in other camps and in the wider Jordanian society. But this was website was closed down due to hacker activity and little was done beyond this to encourage adolescents to network with other young people as part of the programme's activities.

An important theme of suggestions for improvement or additional activities from the focus group discussions with adolescents and parents to need to get out of the camps. One suggestion for additional activities was summarised as: 'excursions and networking with other camps. Got to [get to] know new places, communication with others'. Other suggestions were: 'networking with other camps, local and Arab-world wide'; 'more activities for youth from different camps'. Specific suggestions were:

> There is a need for activities (e.g. sport activities) between Palestinian and Lebanese adolescents. This will be beneficial for both groups in different levels.

> It would be a good idea to have the activities in several centres and not only one centre. More participants from different areas of the camp will be involved.

Internet access and mobile phones are available to many of the Palestinian adolescents surveyed. Networking opportunities could be greatly enhanced if programme resources, as part of adolescent-led initiative, could be directed at promoting the use of a well-known social networking site such as Facebook to encourage Palestinian adolescents to make contact with each other. The project would also need to develop and promote protocols throughout the programme to ensure that it is a 'safe space'.

Recommendation 2.5: Engage more with parents

Key stakeholders and a number of focus group discussants in countries other than Jordan want the programme to include parents more. Suggestions for doing this include offering them more information about the programme, involving them in the decision-making processes and extending its activities such as life skills training to them. A manual based on the key elements of the workshops for parents in Jordan is in the process of being developed. This manual needs to be adopted by the programme in all countries. However, new, more interactive elements, drawing on the success of the 'intergenerational' workshops in Lebanon, also need to be added to the workshop format. The approach used in Lebanon showed the value of joint sessions. This refer to sessions where both adolescents and parents, using a skilled facilitator, have the opportunity to resolve issues within families and, by example, within other families in the community.

The focus of the workshops for parents in Jordan, according to some parents interviewed, was too general, not intensive enough and too short to have a major impact. 'Educating parents on the human rights and the importance of promoting the participation of young people' suggests one-way communication only, with little scope for more active forms of engagement with parents. These should involve ways to include adolescents in the workshops. One suggestion from Jordan was for young people themselves, with training, to run workshops for parents. This was also supported by a centre manager in Syria who also suggested parallel workshops for adolescents and their parents:

> *We should work on both the adolescents and their parents in parallel. We should inform the parents about the results of the programme through meetings and workshops done by adolescents for parents.*

A similar but more specific suggestion to improve the programme came from a training consultant and former head trainer for the programme in Syria:

> *[Provide] Family life skills that includes both parents and adolescents. I have suggested that since 2006, and started to be apply it in a shy way. Adolescents always complain about a gap they have with their parents.*

Another centre manager in Syria also proposed that the programme in the future give more attention to the relationship between adolescents and parents, proposing a joint workshop for parents and adolescents. Such joint workshops would require a more interactive format so that difficult issues are identified and ways for resolving them worked out together. A model for doing this comes from the programme in Lebanon with its support for inter-generational workshops. These are small gatherings of parents and their adolescent children who come together to discuss as a group issues of concern. Families known to the community as having internal conflicts with their adolescent children are encouraged by respected members of the camp popular committee to participate in the workshops.

The major issue adolescents want addressed in a workshop for parents is improving internal family relations. This is evident from the open-ended responses from the participant survey in West Bank, Gaza and Syria (see Attachment 4, Tables 1A to 1C). The most important issue in each of the three locations is related to 'how to deal with or understand their children; communications between parents and children'. It is more prominent in Syria, followed by the Gaza and West Bank responses. The issue of improving family relations is not just one that concerns female adolescents. In Syria and Gaza, more males want this issue addressed, although in the West Bank, females far outnumber of males identifying it as an important issue. Other suggested topics are also related to improving internal family relations. In Gaza and Syria, violence in the family comes next, and in the West Bank it is third, behind allowing daughters to participate in centre activities. Health issues, including reproductive health is an important issue that female adolescents want addressed in workshops for parents.

However, the low response for issues such as children's rights and early marriage may suggest that a more sophisticated approach to engaging with parents is wanted than merely lecturing parents about children's rights or explaining about development stages of adolescence.

Recommendation 2.6: Make remedial learning more effective

Programme participants who experienced remedial learning judged it to be the aspect of the programme likely to have the biggest impact on them. However, there is scope to improve this aspect of the programme in the countries where it operated. The survey results showed that those who identified themselves as slow learners said they benefited less from remedial learning compared to other participants who did not identify themselves as slow learners. For slow learners, the nature, duration and intensity of the assistance may not have been adequate

to produce sufficient improvement in their reading, writing or maths skills.

The original format for the remedial learning was for a schedule of 48 hours per month of after-school sessions to engage 20 adolescents in each of five sessions of Arabic, maths, sports, drama and life skills. Every month a new group of 100 adolescents joined the sessions. However, it is difficult to have a significant impact on literacy and numeracy skills within such a short timeline of 48 hours in a month. So many facilitators continued working beyond the 48 hours with the same group of low achievers in the Arabic and maths classes. However, this practice needs to be made more systematic. It needs to be clear to the facilitator and the student how long they can stay in the programme if they have not attained an agreed standard of competency. A means of doing in the form of a contract of remedial learning is discussed further below in Recommendation 2.6.4.

Recommendation 2.6.1: Measure outcomes

Phase III of the programme in the West Bank and Gaza now includes a 'before' and 'after' assessment of those in the remedial learning component. This practice needs to be extended to other countries where the programme has a remedial component to make it possible to follow-up slow learners who are not responding. These assessment results need to be monitored carefully by the programme at two levels.

At the level of the individual adolescent, this information will make it possible to monitor and help more those starting with the lowest scores. Testing individuals after the remedial learning will show which individuals have improved the least, and therefore, are in need of follow-up assistance. This will require a dedicated function within the programme with responsibility for liaising regularly with the student's teacher or school remedial education specialist.

The 'before and after' assessment results also need to be analysed to see how effective the remedial learning is at the facilitator and centre level. A benchmark level of improvement, such as improved scores for 90 per cent of the students, should be set for each centre. Additional resources should be made provided where a centre or facilitator is falling below this benchmark. At a programme level, issues such as the importance of the duration of the remedial learning, facilitator skills and course content should be part of this analysis to identify where improvement is needed. Extra programme resources will be needed to undertake both types of programme monitoring on a systematic and regular basis.

Recommendation 2.6.2: Need to target slow learners only

The low proportion of self-identified slow learners revealed by the participant survey in the West Bank (13 per cent) suggests that the programme needs to be more systematic about recruiting this target group. Slow learners should be the only group recruited into the remedial learning component. However, to avoid labelling slow learners as a problem group in the eyes of other adolescents, the recruitment process for sports, drama or life skills sessions should be different, and based on criteria that includes both slow learners and others.

The existing process of recruiting slow learners has not been systematic. Some centres have formed close ties to neighbouring schools to identify slow learners. This approach, however, relies on teacher nominations. A more systematic approach would be to first provide all students in the centre's catchment area with information about the programme, and what it is seeking to achieve. Second, it should invite those students who want to participate to undergo an assessment of their literacy and numeracy and to indicate their attitudes to school and future intentions. The programme should then invite those with the low scores but willingness to improve their literacy and numeracy to participate in the remedial learning component of the programme as well as other programme activities.

Recommendation 2.6.3: Make special arrangements for students with little or no literacy

Separate and extended attention should be given to those who have the lowest literacy and numeracy scores. An experienced facilitator in Jenin pointed out that it takes time to build a positive relationship with a student who has severe literacy problems. Problems with literacy are often linked to a lack of self esteem and there are often major problems at home. It may take up to a year for students with severe literacy difficulties to show real progress. Special methods of teaching are required when the student has little or no literacy. The facilitator is also required to make contact the student's parents and to work with them closely so they can offer support and help if they are receptive. Liaison with the student's teacher to develop a joint plan is also a necessary part of the assistance required.

Recommendation 2.6.4: Make use of a contract of remedial learning

This agreement to participate should take the form of an individual contract of remedial learning between the student, the programme and the student's teacher or school's remedial teacher. The contract should include information about the student's literacy and numeracy assessment and how it rates with other students of the same age. The contract should spell out what each party will agree to contribute, including what will determine the student's length of time in the programme. It should also include the student's stated commitment to improve his or her literacy and numeracy. The contract of remedial learning needs to also include the follow-up actions that each party will provide, including the student's own responsibility to seek further help if he or she needs it.

Recommendation 2.6.5: Provide a system-wide response to problem of poor literacy/numeracy among the Palestinian adolescent population

The problem of poor literacy/numeracy levels of Palestinian adolescents is acknowledged by the Ministry of Education in oPt and by UNRWA. It also one of the main factors pushing adolescents out of the school system. The issue needs to be addressed at a system-wide level. It is recommended that UNICEF MENA Regional Office and each UNICEF country office take the lead in developing a joint strategy with the relevant agencies: the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Youth and Sport in oPt and with UNRWA for the schools in the refugee camps. Best practices and lessons learnt from the remedial learning component in oPt, especially the use of 'before and after'assessments and follow-up monitoring, should be used to draft a system-wide strategy.

Recommendation 2.7: Work out a strategy to get more out of adolescent-led initiatives

Another aspect of improving the depth of programme impact is for put more effort and resources into the adolescent-led initiatives. Stakeholders in Jordan raised concerns about the focus of the adolescent-led initiatives on a series of small initiatives run at local camp level which are too limited in what they can achieve. These small initiatives run the risk of raising young people's expectations about the need to solve a major problem but then frustrating those expectations because the resources provided are meagre. The danger is that major social issues such as school drop-outs, violence in schools, family abuse and early marriage are trivialised. This happens by simply raising awareness of the issue at the local level but doing little more than producing and distributing a poster as a response. Much more needs to be done to ensure that adolescent-led initiatives are adequately supported and promoted and that their impact is real and lasting. One male adolescent in a focus group discussion noted: 'many solutions to problems were offered, but [the] solutions were not applied'.

A major stakeholder in Jordan wanted the campaigns to be more than 'plans for one-off activities, they need to be ongoing'. The action research process in Jordan, for example, produced a number of suggestions about the need to improve many aspects of the education system. To tackle these, according to the stakeholder, requires an 'advocacy strategy' to follow up on the issues identified. Tackling violence in the schools or the family, for example, requires other UN agencies and the community to be fully involved in the campaigns. Above all, there is a need to work closely with UNRWA to work out how to integrate school-related initiatives into their programmes.

Once the research has been conducted, agreement needs to be reached by adolescents on a cross-camp basis about key issues of substance. A frame of reference is needed for deciding about what issues to address and how to build a wider base of support for a large-scale social marketing campaign. One such frame of reference already highlighted is the value of fostering an environment that promotes peace and reconciliation as a way to deepen programme impact. An important international or national reference point for deciding what issues to focus on for a social marketing campaign are the five youth-related Millennium Development Goals.

Once the frame of reference has been decided on, those involved in an adolescent-led initiative need to apply a more systematic approach to identifying the key issues, using simple tools specifically designed to conduct a social marketing campaign. For example, the issue of deciding on what behaviour to seek to change is complex. Two renowned experts on social marketing have suggested that at least five criteria need to be considered.[7]

1. Impact (assuming the target audience adopts the proposed behaviour change, what is the potential impact on the issue the campaign is directed at (eg peace and reconciliation, income poverty reduction or making more progress on achieving the youth-related Millennium Development Goals);

2. Demand (how ready, willing, and able is the target audience to perform this behaviour?);

3. Supply (to what extent are other programs or organisations already working to influence the target audience to adopt this behaviour?);

4. Support (what level of support exists for this behaviour change from within the community and key leaders?); and

5. Organisational match (does the organisation mounting the social market campaign have the expertise and resources to influence this behaviour? Is this behaviour compatible with the organisation's mission and consistent with its organisation's values and reputation/brand?).

The selected issues then need to be addressed through a cross-camp campaigns. The campaign should work in partnership with other NGOs, and bring in the private sector. This campaign needs adequate resources for an extended period to have a lasting impact on key issues of concern to adolescents. External expertise in social marketing should also be utilised to help develop the social marketing strategy to underpin the cross-camp campaign. This strategy could be used as the basis for approaching leading enterprises in the private sector to be sponsors.

The adolescent-led initiatives fostered an older group of committed programme participants, now 18 or 19 years olds. In many ways, this group has had the most exposure to the programme and has benefited greatly from this deeper involvement. Their skills are too

---

[7] Philip Kolter and Nancy Lee, 2009, *Up and Out of Poverty: the Social Marketing Solution, a toolkit for policy makers, entrepreneurs, NGOs, companies and governments*. Wharton School Publishing, New Jersey

valuable to lose because they no longer fall within the programme's 10 to 18 year old target group. The programme needs to have a mechanism for continuing to involve this group of committed young people who have been involved in a range of the programmes activities and who want to stay involved.

3. Extending Programme Reach

Most of the participant's in Yarmouk camp are those successful students who came first in their classes. We used to take them out of school to attend workshops.

Source: Programme supporter, Syria

The program activities did not well meet the activities that adolescents identified as a priority. Activities should reach out to a bigger number of adolescents.

Source: Programme supporter, Refugee Camp, Jordan

Many stakeholders asked the programme to extend its reach so that more adolescents could benefit. Data on programme reach suggests that up to a quarter of adolescents in the refugee camps were able to participate in some way in the programme. The process for recruiting programme participants was usually selected on a 'first come, first served' basis. Some stakeholders asked for a more transparent process so that charges of favouritism could be more easily rebutted. Other stakeholders noted that information about the programme was not distributed in a systematic way to all potential participants.

Recommendation 3.1: Work out who is missing out

Many adolescents may not have had a chance to participate in the programme because their parents did not understand the programme's objectives or have their concerns met. The resistance of many parents to the programme has been addressed by measures such as parent support groups in Jordan and parent representatives serving on local management committees for the programme in oPt. However, it is possible that the programme participants self-select because their parents are favourable to the programme's objectives or have been persuaded of the programme's good intentions. Those adolescents not participating in the programme may be from families have refused their permission to participate because their fears have not been addressed.

A more systematic approach to marketing the programme will require up-to-date information about the number of adolescents in the programme's catchment area. This information will also need to identify important subgroups of adolescents, as the participant survey did on a self-identification basis. However, extending the reach of the programme's activities should be done as an activity goal, as each activity may require a different strategy for increasing the numbers involved in that activity.

Recommendation 3.2: Develop a social marketing plan

Extending the reach of the programme requires more systematic information about not only about the total adolescent population in the geographical areas the programme operates in but also the households they are part of. A social marketing plan for the programme is needed, based on the following steps.[8]

---

[8] The following elements of a social marketing strategy have been informed by reading Philip Kolter and Nancy Lee, 2009, *Up and Out of Poverty: the Social Marketing Solution, a toolkit for policy makers, entrepreneurs, NGOs, companies and governments*. Wharton School Publishing, New Jersey, Chapter 4: 'Segmenting the poverty marketplace'.

1. Conduct a survey in each camp or specific centre catchment area to identify the total potential number of households containing adolescents, collecting information on their geographical location within the designated survey area, gender, age and education status, where they attend school, their leisure activities, and the barriers to participating in the centre's activities. These should include adolescent and parental awareness of the programme, parents' attitudes to their children's involvement in activities at the centre, access to transport, economic condition of the household and other factors. Information should also be sought on whether and to what extent parents are involved in community-based organisations.

2. Use the survey to provide all households with general information about the programme and the activities it runs and its future directions.

3. Analyse the survey results to work out the segments of the target population of households that are more or less conducive to participating in the programme. Further analysis should identify the segments defined as most 'most ready' and 'least ready' to participate in the programme. These segments should be further described in terms of where they are located, economic condition of household, and nature of the barriers to participation in the programme.

4. Work out ways these barriers to programme participants can be addressed.

5. Prepare an information kit for each segment and subgroups of families, addressing their current level of knowledge, attitudes and practices in regard to what their adolescent children are allowed or not allowed to do and the specific barriers identified.

6. Visit each family with information and visitors tailored to the profile of the family.

Recommendation 3.3: Extend programme reach to more parents

The results of the participant survey show that the workshops for parents in Jordan had an additional beneficial effect on improving communications in the family. The numbers of parents coming to the workshops was small compared with the potential population of parents of adolescents. Community supporters of the programme in Jordan and Syria, including a school principal, wanted the programme to reach out to more parents. In particular, a major shortcoming of the recruitment process for the workshops was the small number of fathers who took part.

The reason often given for their absence was that fathers were too busy working long hours to find the time to come to a workshop. However, where workshops were held at times and venues suitable for working fathers to attend, attendance increased. In Barqa camp, for example, where a special effort was made to include fathers, their participation was notably higher than elsewhere. Events such as social gatherings in a sports club on Friday nights with guest speakers such as former football players, successful businessmen and journalists are much more likely to attract fathers. Needless to say, the topics for the talks need to be related to the programme's objectives and activities.

Recommendation 3.4: Use different ways to market the programme to parents

The parents' focus group discussion in Syria made the suggestion that the programme should organise an annual celebration to honour adolescents' parents by giving them appreciation certificate and organising trips for them. Another focus group in Syria proposed special trips for trainers and parents. In relation to a question about how to get more fathers to take part in the parents workshop, a training consultant for Syria offered this proposal:

I suggest increasing the awareness of the parents where they are ... This can be done through visits by the adolescence to the homes. They should have a committee to do these visits. Some of them in [camp name], for example, made visits and offered roses to mothers on mothers day.

Recommendation 3.5: Reach out to other vulnerable adolescents

The programme appears to have focused exclusively on adolescents in school. School drop-outs were identified by a number of participatory action research projects as an important group of vulnerable adolescents and stakeholders wanted more to be done to involve them in the programme. Some early attempts were made by those implementing the programme to include school drop-outs. However, in most cases, they failed to stay in the programme as they felt out of place due to the dominance of school students.

This means that extending the programme's reach to include school drop-outs as an explicit target group will not have much effect unless special activities are designed for their needs. For example, the range of issues covered in life skills training needs to be broadened to include basic financial competencies such as how to budget, save, borrow money and make effective use of credit access. UNICEF Jordan is now working with Save the Children to pilot test in three camps of a new employability component in the life skills training which will address financial competency as well as preparing first-time job seekers for employment.

Recommendation 3.6: Focus on post-school options

The pilot testing of an employability component for life skills training in three camps in Phrase III in Jordan will address a major gap in the programme. Women Centre facilitators are being trained to conduct workshops over four weeks to help young people explore their own aptitudes and potential, how to identify sources of background information and discuss education and career options with their parents. Training will also be provided in financial literacy. This will cover how to set personal goals, make informed decisions, how to budget, how to save and how to use credit. Basic skills in how to manage money as a self-employed service provider or employee will be also provided.

Future participatory action research could collect information about the needs of school drop-outs with a view to incorporating the findings into the design of these activities for this target group. One idea from the focus group discussions and key stakeholders is for the programme to do more to promote a spirit of volunteerism and to organise volunteer activities. One focus of the action research could be to investigate the feasibility of engaging school drop-outs in a volunteer activity, especially if it is related to providing work discipline skills. Other efforts could be made to promote volunteerism. University students could be encouraged and supported to volunteer to work with adolescents in the camps during their long summer break. However, promoting opportunities for volunteers needs a strategy worked out jointly with other UN agencies and NGOs. Implementing the strategy will also require a project officer, an office and resources.

Recommendation 3.7: Counter parent & community pessimism about future prospects for their young people

A key role for the programme should be to challenge the pessimism of parents and the community that most adolescents face about their future prospects.[9] This can be done by giving them and their parents access to accurate information about their employment and livelihoods opportunities. The employability module, outlined above, include an exercise called youth livelihood mapping. Young people are helped to gather, organise, and analyse career opportunities by actively seeking out information on labour market and livelihood opportunities, including openings for internships during summer to prove on-the-job work experience and learning opportunity in a private sector enterprise.[10] Action research could also support school drop-outs by mapping out available private sector opportunities in their area as well as potential opportunities to generate income as self-employed service providers.

4. Emphasising Some Objectives at the Expense of Others

The third futures scenario has to do with sharpening the focus of the programme. This evaluation has noted at several points how the programme started with the perspective of service providers helping vulnerable adolescents to survive and cope with a system that was clearly responding poorly to their needs. However, with the addition of some new objectives in Phase II, the programme participants acquired new capacities, tools and opportunities, enabling them to take the lead as agents of positive change. As a result, the centres developed a different locus, process and orientation in how they ran the programme.

Recommendation 4.1: Accentuate more the programme's theme: agents of positive change

This possible future direction proposes that the programme build on the theme of 'agents of positive change' to strengthen those activities that explicitly foster adolescent capabilities and open up opportunities. At the same time, this would also require taking resources away from other activities less connected to this theme and directing them to the preferred activities. In concrete terms, this would involve focusing more on participatory action research and adolescent-led initiatives. With more resources, these activities could be run at a more sophisticated level. They could produce more substantial outcomes such as the social mapping or audit of a community or mounting a cross-community campaign that had been carefully designed and planned out.

Recommendation 4.2: De-emphasising other activities

The activities that could be allocated fewer resources are sport and drama/folklore/dancing. These activities can be more easily provided by existing facilities such as sports clubs and women programme centres, with relatively little resources. The survey of programme participants found that learning to play a sport in particular was not as highly valued by participants as other activities. Although it delivered some valuable benefits to individuals, participants placed a higher value on other activities which conferred benefits of increased self expression and the capacity to contribute to the local community.

---

[9] One of the findings of focus discussion group conducted by Save the Children as part of its market research for 'Mostaqbaly II Project For Palestinian Refugee Adolescents & Youth Career Preparedness'. Save the Children proposal submitted to UNICEF/Jordan Office, May 2009

[10] Save the Children, 2009, 'Mostaqbaly II Project For Palestinian Refugee Adolescents & Youth Career Preparedness'. Proposal submitted to UNICEF/Jordan Office, May, pp 9-10.

Recommendation 4.3: Work out how to add more value to some programme activities

From the perspective of the theme 'agents of positive change', sport and drama, folklore and dancing are activities that have a number of limitations. Physically, they keep young people in the centres or in designated locations. The nature of the activity also keeps adolescents focused in on themselves rather than linking them more into the wider community. Finally, the skills acquired in these activities may have little broader applicability other than learning about team work in a play setting.

These limitations could be at least partially overcome if more value is added to these activities. For example, in the West Bank and Gaza, adolescent-led initiatives used sporting activities such as marathons and soccer games to promote female participation in sport and the need for the community to provide more opportunities for this. Sporting events can also be used to mount social marketing campaigns to promote the need for behaviour change by 'walking the talk'. For example, adolescents in Jericho organised a marathon as part of an awareness raising campaign on healthy lifestyle and the prevention of substance abuse. Around 300 adolescents and college students participated in the marathon.

5. Changing focus to achieve programme sustainability

> Our role is to institutionalise the programme, not to continue funding. The programme should be owned by the local community... the programme should be handed over to our partners. UNRWA should have a programme. A coordinator was appointed in UNRWA to follow-up the adolescent programs.
>
> Source: Assistant Director for the Adolescent programme, UNICEF Syria

A fourth possible new direction for the programme is one dictated by a sustainability strategy. The core funds for the programme are likely to continue into a fourth phase. This offers a breathing space for UNICEF to devise and implement a sustainability strategy that will ensure that the impact of the programme continues, even if its form changes. This strategy may require that the successful elements of the programme are transferred to mainstream institutions to ensure ongoing funding. The strategy may also dictate other changes necessary to attract external funding support from new sources such as corporate sponsors. The following discussion of options is offered on a 'future scenario' basis to throw light on what major changes may be needed to make the programme's activities sustainable.

The following discussion of ways to address programme sustainability concentrates on oPt remedial learning component of the programme in oPt. This is because it is the largest element within the overall programme, is dependent, in its extended form, on precarious funding and its focus overlaps with the mandates of other agencies. However, similar analysis could be applied to the situation in Jordan in terms of whether the programme is absorbed into the day to day operations of Women's Programme Centres as a UNRWA-funded activity or whether it continues as a stand-alone programme able to tap its own sources of funds.

Recommendation 5.1: Address whether programme is consistent with possible future UNICEF strategy

UNICEF may in the future decide that it does not want to continue to support a largely stand-alone programme as its main strategy for meeting the needs of Palestinian adolescents. Continuing to devote considerable internal resources to overseeing the programme in its current form restricts what UNICEF can do elsewhere in relation to adolescent development and participation. UNICEF may decide, for example, that having shown how to address the needs of adolescents still in school, it wants to do more to help out-of-school adolescents who are looking for work.

UNICEF may see overseeing a stand-alone programme based on time-limited external funds as not a desirable long-term option. UNICEF's mandate requires it to focus primarily on being an advocate for the needs of adolescents rather than as a long-term provider of services to meet those needs. Continuing to oversee the programme also creates a risk for UNICEF. If or when donor funding ends, and the programme cannot continue, UNICEF's reputation with the national governments and civil society will be damaged. The role of independent service provider is a function that others, such as competent NGOs, can do just as well, or better. As demonstrated in Jordan, West Bank and Gaza, other managing agents can run in time the programme well, with less and less need for close supervision of all aspects of programme operation by a third party.

UNICEF's mandate is to support activities that complement and do not overlap with the work of other UN agencies or national authorities. UNICEF may decide that, in the interests of better interagency cooperation, a major review is required of the overlap of the programme's activities in relation to the work of other agencies. This applies, in particular, to the programme's remedial learning component and the mandates of UNRWA and the Ministry of Education to provide good quality education for all Palestinians. However, the overlap also applies to the programme's sporting, drama and folklore activities where the Ministry of Youth and Sport in oPt has a mandate to support youth and sport clubs to provide these activities.

Recommendation 5.2: Making remedial learning an ongoing activity

Any new sustainability strategy is likely to acknowledge the precariousness of the existing programme in the West Bank and Gaza, especially for maintaining the current scale of operations. The extension of the programme in oPt from the 14 centres funded by Norway to 68 centres has been achieved by taping available emergency funds, allocated on a year-to-year basis. However, the chances are high that these funds could be redirected in the future, particularly if a new emergency erupts.

Option 1: Integrate remedial learning into the school system

This evaluation has presented evidence of the value of the remedial learning component. The key features contributing to its success have been outlined in the chapter on lessons learned. The challenge is to work out how to how to capture the key components of this success so that they can be used to lift permanently the quality of education in the systems run by UNRWA in the refugee camps in oPt, Jordan, Syria and the schools run by the Ministry of Education of the Palestinian Authority.

As many facilitators are also teachers (60 per cent working for Tamar are), many successful ingredients of remedial learning could be relatively easily transferred into the school system. The programme in oPt now runs remedial learning sessions in 24 schools after the end of classes as a programme-funded activity. This responds better to the needs of girls in more traditional settings such as in Hebron, where they can stay in the school grounds rather than

have to travel to a centre to take part in the remedial learning sessions. This approach could be taken further and the sessions could be integrated into the schools as part of their normal routine, funded by the UNRWA budget. In Lebanon, as noted above, the UNICEF Palestinian Programme & UNRWA Education Department have agreed to integrate UNICEF's Remedial Education component into UNRWA schools in 2009.

Option 2: Operate remedial learning from separate centres

> When the programme is away from the school it's more creative, it increases self-esteem and creative ideas.
>
> Source: Life skills facilitator, Kofur Zeibad Club Hicham Shana, West Bank
>
> In school there is a [maths] text book that teacher should finish on time while here at the club the situation is different. The way of teaching students is different as here we teach students according to their needs and what they want to know. Therefore there is a chance for the student to ask questions with more freedom...
>
> Source: The maths facilitator, Abween Club, West Bank

However, as the above quote shows, a good case can be made to keep the remedial learning as a separate after-school activity, with a separate budget, separate selection of facilitators and separate 'before and after' assessment of students.[11] UNRWA and UNICEF could work together to seek funding from a Special Millennium Development Goal fund to pay for this separate activity to ensure that the MDG targets related to education such as youth literacy and numeracy can be met. It is likely that operating from a separate location is an important feature contributing to its success. According to the Tamar programme coordinator, using school buildings is less popular among many students as they want to use a space over which they have more control.

Operating the programme through the community-based centres has also had another more important benefit. Through the programme's local management committees, the community has an opportunity to accept more responsibility for the quality of their children's learning. The programme has shown them how to improve their children's learning in a direct and immediate way that they have control over. The community centres, by continuing to run remedial learning lessons and interacting with the school system, can be a valuable source of external pressure on the education system to lift its performance.

As noted in Chapter Nine, another key to the success of the programme in oPt has been its delivery through two well-established NGOs, one specialising in community education and the other in administrative capacity building for community-based organisations. The intermediary role that these NGOs played needs has been crucial in making sure that the remedial learning is of high quality and is hitting the mark. Their role needs to be included in any longer-term arrangements focused on delivering remedial learning through stand-alone centres.

In Jordan, remedial learning lessons are provided by the Women Programme Centres but are not funded by the programme. They are paid for on a fee-for-service basis. Centres elsewhere need to work out which courses are in high demand and do not primarily serve a designated programme target group such as slow learners. For example, courses in English and computers are likely to be in high demand and do not especially serve the needs of slow learners seeking improved proficiency in Arabic and maths. These courses, therefore, are prime candidates for

---

[11] It is not a given that centre-based remedial learning is always better. One focus group discussion noted that 'Adolescents felt that they are studying the same things at the school and the centre with no change in the teaching style' and that there was a need for 'to change their teaching style and their behaviours towards adolescents'.

generating fees.

Those students who designate themselves as slow learners should be eligible for direct funding to enable them to purchase a number of hours of training related to computers or English if they want this training. Again, funds could be sought from a special Millennium Development Goal fund to support the achievement of the education targets, and youth literacy and numeracy in particular.

Recommendation 5.3: Develop a sustainability strategy for Phase IV

All centres hosting the programme need to be made aware of sustainability as an urgent issue of the first priority. It is recommended that UNICEF MENA regional office take the lead in developing in close association with each country office a programme sustainability strategy to be implemented in Phase IV of the programme. As the oPt study proposed, sustainability needs to be defined in a broad way to include building up more community and government support as well as finding other funding sources. The centres and other stakeholders need to foster better internal representation of those involved in the programme, better forms of accountability within the centres, and better links with the local community, municipalities and national agencies. The strategy needs to set out guidelines on what is expected of the centres in terms of sustainability and time lines for achieving this. Performance measures on sustainability should be proposed to assess progress.

Recommendation 5.3.1: Encourage each centre to charge fees for some activities

The sustainability strategy should be based on a requirement for each centre, as a condition for continued funding, to commit to seek funds from other sources. To send a clear signal about what this will mean, notice should be given that programme funding for, say, equipment supplies, will be reduced each year in the expectation that the external funds generated by the centre will cover the shortfall. An agreed amount of funds from outside sources for each centre should be negotiated as a key part of a new agreement with the centre.

Charging fees for courses is an option that has to be explored fully. The Vice Minister of Youth and Sport in oPt wants centres to look closely at the activities they offer to see whether they can charge fees for participation. These fees could be paid for by individuals or they could take the form of scholarships, funded by the community or by local businesses. Where courses are in high demand, and do little to serve the needs of a vulnerable target group, fees should be charged. Examples are English language and computer courses. Gym and aerobic classes using programme equipment but not serving the needs of a programme target group should also carry a charge.

The high rating for community use of technology, with five centres scoring the highest rating, shows that most centres allow the wider community to use the computers provided by the programme. This also suggests that there is a strong demand for access to computers for training or general use. However, keeping this access open incurs additional running costs such as extra electricity use and the need for regular repair and maintenance to ensure their continued functioning. Access to the computers could be charged for and run as a separate cost centre or small business within the centre. This cost centre would need to cover its own costs, including a stipend for a supervisor, and pay a fee to the centre. Different charges for using computers for school work and for playing games could be applied. If access to the Internet is provided, this should be charged at a higher rate than the rate charged in nearby commercial Internet cafes. This will stop this service undercutting local businesses providing the same service. It will also show what a fully costed fee for using the Internet should be, based on all the overhead costs.

Recommendation 5.3.2: Investigate setting up a Palestinian National Youth Fund in each country

The sustainability strategy should also address the issue of long term funding for the programme's activities. One way to do this is to propose setting up a Palestinian National Youth Fund in each country. The main stakeholders should investigate all possible funding sources to set up this Fund. As described in the previous chapter, UNICEF could identify and approach national and regional corporate partners who can provide funds for particular activities. The Ministry of Youth and Sport in oPt could investigate whether and under what conditions donors and the private sector are interested in supporting such a Fund. UNRWA and UNICEF in Jordan, Lebanon and Syria countries should jointly take the lead in approaching donors and the private sector to support such a Fund.[12]

Recommendation 5.3.3: Develop a strategy to identify and propose corporate partnerships

The UNICEF web page on corporate partnerships does not list any national corporate partners for countries in the MENA region. It is recommended that UNICEF commission an international consultant specialising in corporate responsibility to design a suitable strategy for a corporate partnership and to identify potential partners. This strategy should involve a partnership with UNICEF, similar to the international and national corporate partnerships UNICEF has with, for example, the pen maker, 'Montblanc' to promote international literacy.

The proposed strategy should be debated within the UNICEF MENA region and its broad outline endorsed as the basis for approaching interested companies. It is proposed that a team of three from UNICEF approach senior management in these companies. The team should consist of the consultant, the UNICEF regional officer working on adolescent programming and the UNICEF Regional Deputy Representative. These meetings can be used to assess the level of interest and to identify the specific conditions these companies would be prepared to invest in youth programmes or a National Youth Fund. The final stages of the process would involve negotiating the terms of a partnership, including the outcome measures that the company could use for internal and external publicity.

Conclusion

These four possible directions for the programme all suggest departures from current practice in terms of scale, reach, focus and funding. Deepening the impact of the programme will require fine tuning of a number of successful features of the programme and additional resources. Broadening the programme's reach will require not only more resources but new activities as well. Emphasising more the theme of agents of positive change will require the adoption of new ways of working. The final scenario, based on the dictates of a sustainability strategy, may offer the biggest challenge as it involves moving away from the certainty of existing programme structures to the uncertainty of devolving the responsibility for running activities to schools or the centres themselves. It also involves entering into partnerships with enterprises to tap new funding sources in the private sector. These partnerships will bring with them new requirements and expectations.

---

[12] According to an official in Jordan, UNRWA is said to be trying to initiate partnerships with other agencies such as Save The Children and START on youth issues

Attachment 1: Matrix of recommendations for each country and UNICEF Regional Office

Recommendations	oPt	Jordan	Leba-non	Syria	UNICEF MENA
1.1: Set up a simple monitoring system			☑		
1.2: Introduce simple progress measures			☑		
1.3: Use widely accepted indicators to show programme impact			☑		
1.4: Publish the results of the evaluation & provide a follow-up action plan					☑
2.1: Do more to promote peace and reconciliation	☑	☑		☑	
2.2: Get more out of life skills training	☑	☑	☑	☑	
2.3: Enhance the skills of programme facilitators	☑	☑	☑	☑	
2.4: Do more outside the closed world of the refugee camps	☑	☑	☑	☑	
2.5: Engage more with parents	☑	☑	☑	☑	
2.6: Make remedial learning more effective	☑		☑		
2.6.1: Measure outcomes	☑		☑		
2.6.2: Need to target slow learners only	☑		☑		
2.6.3: Make special arrangements for students with little or no literacy	☑		☑		
2.6.4: Make use of a contract of remedial learning	☑		☑		
2.6.5: Provide a system-wide response to problem of poor literacy/numeracy among the Palestinian adolescent population	☑	☑	☑	☑	☑
3.1: Work out who is missing out	☑	☑	☑	☑	
3.2: Develop a social marketing plan	☑	☑	☑	☑	☑
3.3: Extend programme reach to more parents	☑	☑	☑	☑	
3.4: Use different ways to market the programme to parents	☑	☑	☑	☑	
3.5: Reach out to other vulnerable adolescents	☑	☑	☑	☑	
3.6: Focus on post-school options	☑		☑	☑	
3.7: Counter parent & community pessimism about future prospects for their young people	☑	☑	☑	☑	
4.1: Accentuate more the programme's theme: agents of positive change	☑	☑	☑	☑	☑
4.2: De-emphasising other activities	☑	☑	☑	☑	

4.3: Work out how to add more value to some programme activities	☑	☑	☑	☑	
5.1: Address whether programme is consistent with possible future UNICEF strategy					☑
5.2: Options for making remedial learning an ongoing activity	☑				
5.3 Develop a sustainability strategy for Phase IV	☑	☑	☑	☑	☑
5.3.1 Encourage each centre to charge fees for some activities	☑	☑	☑	☑	
5.3.2 Investigate setting up a Palestinian National Youth Fund in each country	☑	☑	☑	☑	☑
5.3.3: Develop a strategy to identify and propose corporate partnerships					☑